

### SCORESHEET

stage: 4  
 fight (round no.): 4  
 reporter: United Kingdom  
 opponent: Korea  
 room: 3  
 problem no.:  
 Juror's name: HIGASHIKAWA  
 signature: *Higashikawa*

REPORT	phenomenon explanation	theory/model	relevant experiments	comparison between theory and experiment	own contribution	task fulfillment
0	almost no	almost no	too few	no/almost no	others' data, incorrectly cited	misunderstood
1	some	some	some	some	review of sources, cited	partly
2	fair	fair	well performed, fair	not well fitting	some own input	average
3	good	good	sufficient number	qualitatively analysed	+ some interesting results	interesting solution
4	detailed	quite detailed, errors analysed	+ results explained	+ theory limits	considerable experimental	some aspects
5	demonstrative	correct	correct	explained, conclusive	or theoretical	above average
6	deep and comprehensive, shows physical insight	detailed, complex, completely testable	+ reproducible, convincing analysis	well fitting, deviations analysed, conclusive	considerable experimental and theoretical	greater extent than expected

NOTES:

REPORTER  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 1 + 2 + 2 = 5

DISCUSSION WITH REPORTER	scientific contribution	relevance of topics presented	own opinions of the discussion	opponent's conduct of the discussion	priority
0	almost no	irrelevant	very little	poor	no
1	little	some	some aspects fine	some	some
2	partial	average	some correct	good	reasonable
3	good	most	many correct	some aspects efficient	fair
4	new crucial point(s)	all relevant	+ improvements	overall efficient	very good

NOTES:

OPONENT  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 1 + 2 + 2 = 5

DISCUSSION WITH Oponent	relevant arguments/responses	reporter's conduct at the discussion	scientific contribution	relevance of topics presented	own opinions of the discussion	priority
0	almost no	poor	almost no	irrelevant	almost no	no
1	some	some aspects fine	some	some	some	some
2	good	good	some correct	good	reasonable	reasonable
3	deep and comprehensive, shows physical insight	detailed, complex, completely testable	well fitting, deviations analysed, conclusive	considerable experimental and theoretical	greater extent than expected	above average

NOTES:

REVIEWER  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 1 + 2 + 2 = 5

**SCORESHEET**  
 stage: 4 UK  
 reporter: UK  
 fight (round no.): 4  
 opponent: Korea  
 room: B  
 problem no.: 13  
 reviewer: Germany working time  
 Juror's name: MATEV  
 signature: MATEV

REPORTER  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 $1 + 3.1 + 2.6 - 0.3 = 6.4$  (6)

REPORT	phenomenon explanation	theory/model	relevant experiments	comparison between theory and experiment	own contribution	task fulfillment
0	almost no	almost no	too few	no/almost no	others' data, incorrectly cited	misunderstood
1	some	some	some	some	review of sources, cited	partly
2	fair	fair	fair	not well fitting	some own input	average
3	good	good	well performed, sufficient number	deviations qualitatively analysed	+ some interesting results	interesting solution
4	detailed	quite detailed, correct	+ results explained	+ theory limits explained, conclusive	considerable experimental	some aspects above average
5	demonstrative	detailed, complex, reproducible, errors analysed	correct	well fitting, deviations analysed, conclusive	considerable experimental or theoretical	some aspects greater extent than expected
6	deep and comprehensive, shows physical insight	completely testable	convincing analysis	analysed, conclusive	and theoretical	

  

DISCUSSION WITH OPONENT	relevant reporter's conduct	scientific contribution	arguments/responses	relevant reporter's conduct	overall efficient
0	almost no	almost no	too few	poor	some aspects fine
1	only technical	only technical	some	some	some
2	points cleared	points cleared	many	many	good
3	interesting points discussed	interesting points brought in new	convincingly supported	+ data/theory	some aspects efficient
4	physics	brought in new	proved deep understanding	overall efficient	very good

NOTES: 6 rejected (ring order)

OPONENT  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 $1 + 1.5 + 3.0 + 2.5 - 0 = 8$

QUESTIONS ASKED	understanding of relevant topics addressed	own opinions presented	priority	time management
0	almost no, irrelevant	no or irrelevant	very little	poor
1	relevant, aimed at resolving unclear points in the report	few	some	reasonable
2	+ short, apt and clear, well prioritized, all time used	main points	some correct	fair
3	all relevant points	many	many correct	efficient
4	practically all points	practically all	+ improvement suggestions	all time used

  

DISCUSSION WITH REPORTER	scientific relevance	own opinions presented	opponent's conduct of the discussion	priority
0	almost no	irrelevant	very little	poor
1	little	irrelevant	some	some
2	partial	average	some correct	good
3	good	most	many correct	some aspects efficient
4	new crucial points	all relevant discussed	+ improvement suggestions	overall efficient

REVIEWER  
 Start from 1 and add/subtract  
 $1 + 1.8 + 2.4 + 2.1 - 0 = 7.3$  (7)

QUESTIONS ASKED	report summary & understanding	pros & cons	discussion analysis	own opinions	priority
0	too few, mostly irrelevant	irrelevant	almost no	too few	no
1	some relevant, sufficient number, contributed to clarify some unclear points	partially relevant	too short/long	some	some
2	many unclear points resolved; most time used, suitably allotted to Rep & Opp	mostly adequate	relevant parts	many	reasonable
3	+ short, apt and clear, well prioritized, time managed efficiently	fully	adequate	conclusive, accurate, suggestions	good

  

REVIEW OF REPORT	report summary	discussion analysis	own opinions	priority
0	poor	irrelevant	almost no	too few
1	partial	partially relevant	too short/long	some
2	good	mostly adequate	relevant parts	many
3	detailed, complex	fully	adequate	conclusive, accurate, suggestions

  

REVIEW OF OPPOSITION	speech summary	pros & cons	discussion analysis	own opinions	priority
0	poor	irrelevant	almost no	too few	no
1	too short/long	partially relevant	too short/long	some	some
2	informative, apt	mostly adequate	relevant parts	many	reasonable
3	condensed and accurate	fully	adequate	conclusive, accurate, suggestions	good